

**To:** Kathy Glennan, Chair, RDA Steering Committee

**CC:** Renate Behrens, RSC Chair-Elect  
Linda Barnhart, RSC Secretary  
Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary-Elect

**From:** Daniel Paradis, Translation Teams Liaison Officer

**Subject:** Formal response to RSC/RSCSecretary/2022/4 - Proposal to amend and clarify instructions in Manifestation “place of” elements

**Recommendation 1:** I generally support the recommendation but would like to offer some suggestions to improve the instructions.

I note that the instruction in the original Toolkit about including prepositions was not added. This instruction is of relevance when the name on a manifestation is in a language where the case ending changes according to the grammatical function of the name (e.g., Praze in the locative case versus Praha in the nominative case). Keeping the preposition is important to make sense of the statement. I suggest adding an option to record a preposition that appears with a place name, whether a local place name or the name of a larger place (the example in original RDA shows a local place name but a preposition could also be used with the name of a larger place). Because such an option could also apply to fictitious place names, I suggest adding it before “Local and larger place names.”

Original RDA overlooked the possibility that the place name appearing on a manifestation might consist solely of a larger place (e.g., state, province, country). I suggest filling this gap by expanding the first condition/option under “Local and larger place names.”

I don’t think that the option to record the full address should be associated with the second condition/option relating to a larger place being present on a manifestation. As the example of a full address in original RDA shows (“6 Ludgate Hill, London”), an address does not always include the name of a larger place, as is often the case when the local place name is well known internationally. I would therefore make it a separate condition.

I find the third condition in the last condition/option under “Local and larger place names” too limiting. A name of a larger place is not added solely when “[t]he local place name is known to be used in other places” but also when the local place is considered to be little known and therefore requires the name of a larger place to be identified correctly. I suggest rewording this option thus: A name of a larger place is considered necessary for identification.

I support subsuming the condition/option for “place of publication not identified” into the “Place names not found” subsection. I’m not sure, however, that the suggested rewording for the condition is necessary. I note that the condition is worded in such a way that it can be used as boilerplate text for several elements; it is indeed used in 15 elements of which 10 are not covered by this proposal. Amending it for consistency within the element does not seem worthwhile. As for the option, I note that adding “the value” does not follow the standard phrasing used elsewhere in the Toolkit in instructions that require a particular phrase to be recorded.

Finally, in some conditions and options, “the manifestation” should be replaced with “a manifestation.” In the conditions ending with "local place name (city, town, etc.)", the final period after the closing parenthesis is missing.

I suggest the following revisions (changes compared to the original proposal are highlighted in yellow in the marked-up version):

## Marked-up version:

### Manifestation: place of publication

#### Recording an unstructured description

Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).

##### OPTION

Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).

##### OPTION

Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on normalized transcription](#).

##### OPTION

Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using any transcription guidelines.

##### OPTION

Record a preposition that appears with a place name if it is required to make sense of the statement.

#### Local and larger place names

##### CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) is a local place name (city, town, etc.) [or a name of a larger place](#).

##### OPTION

Record a value of a local place name [or of a name of a larger place](#).

##### OPTION

Record both a local place name (city, town, etc.) and a name of a larger place (state, province, country, etc.) if present on the manifestation.

##### CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) is a local place name (city, town, etc.) [A name of a larger place is present on a manifestation](#).

OPTION

Record a value of both a local place name (city, town, etc.) and a name of a larger place.

CONDITION

A full address is present on a manifestation.

OPTION

Record ~~at the~~ full address as part of a local place name.

CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) is a local place name (city, town, etc.).

A name of a larger place is not present on a manifestation.

A name of a larger place is considered necessary for identification.

OPTION

Record a value of both a local place name (city, town, etc.) and a name of a larger place taken from another *source of information*.

Fictitious place names

CONDITION

A value of this element is known to be false or refers to a fictitious entity.

OPTION

Record a fictitious or false value as it appears on a manifestation that is being described.

~~OPTION~~

~~Record a real value that is known from another *source of information*.~~

OPTION

Record a fictitious or false value as a Manifestation: [note on publication statement](#).

OPTION

Record a fictitious or false value within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation publication statement](#).

OPTION

Record a real value that is known from another *source of information*.

OPTION

Record a real value that is known from another *source of information* as a Manifestation: [note on publication statement](#).

For general guidance on fictitious entities and non-human personages, see Guidance: [Fictitious and non-human appellations](#).

### Place names not found

#### CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) cannot be found in a manifestation that is being described.

#### OPTION

Record a value for a place that is known from another *source of information*.

Record a value for a [local place name](#) (city, town, etc.) and include a name of a larger place if necessary for identification.

#### OPTION

Record a value for a probable place.

Record a value for a [local place name](#) (city, town, etc.) and include a name of a larger place if necessary for identification.

#### OPTION

Record a value for a probable place followed by a question mark.

Record a value for a [local place name](#) (city, town, etc.) and include a name of a larger place if necessary for identification.

#### CONDITION

A manifestation does not have a value that can reasonably be determined.

#### OPTION

Record *place of publication not identified*.

Indicate that the information is taken from a source that is outside the manifestation that is being described. For general guidance, see Guidance: Data provenance. [Recording a source of metadata](#). For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).

~~Place of publication not identified~~

#### ~~CONDITION~~

~~A manifestation does not have a value that can reasonably be determined.~~

#### ~~OPTION~~

~~Record *place of publication not identified*.~~

Clean version:

## Manifestation: place of publication

### Recording an unstructured description

Record an unstructured description for a related place as a value of Place: [name of place](#).

#### OPTION

Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on basic transcription](#).

#### OPTION

Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using Guidance: Transcription guidelines. [Guidelines on normalized transcription](#).

#### OPTION

Record an unstructured description by transcribing text and spoken word content from a manifestation using any transcription guidelines.

#### OPTION

Record a preposition that appears with a place name if it is required to make sense of the statement.

### Local and larger place names

#### CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) is a local place name (city, town, etc.) or a name of a larger place.

#### OPTION

Record a value of a local place name or of a name of a larger place.

#### CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) is a local place name (city, town, etc.).  
A name of a larger place is present on a manifestation.

#### OPTION

Record a value of both a local place name (city, town, etc.) and a name of a larger place.

#### CONDITION

A full address is present on a manifestation.

#### OPTION

Record a full address.

#### CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) is a local place name (city, town, etc.).

A name of a larger place is not present on a manifestation.

A name of a larger place is considered necessary for identification.

#### OPTION

Record a value of both a local place name (city, town, etc.) and a name of a larger place taken from another *source of information*.

#### Fictitious place names

#### CONDITION

A value of this element is known to be false or refers to a fictitious entity.

#### OPTION

Record a fictitious or false value as it appears on a manifestation that is being described.

#### OPTION

Record a fictitious or false value as a Manifestation: [note on publication statement](#).

#### OPTION

Record a fictitious or false value within a value of Manifestation: [manifestation publication statement](#).

#### OPTION

Record a real value that is known from another *source of information*.

#### OPTION

Record a real value that is known from another *source of information* as a Manifestation: [note on publication statement](#).

For general guidance on fictitious entities and non-human personages, see Guidance: [Fictitious and non-human appellations](#).

#### Place names not found

#### CONDITION

A value of Manifestation: [place of publication](#) cannot be found in a manifestation that is being described.

#### OPTION

Record a value for a place that is known from another *source of information*.

Record a value for a local place name (city, town, etc.) and include a name of a larger place if necessary for identification.

OPTION

Record a value for a probable place.

Record a value for a local place name (city, town, etc.) and include a name of a larger place if necessary for identification.

OPTION

Record a value for a probable place followed by a question mark.

Record a value for a local place name (city, town, etc.) and include a name of a larger place if necessary for identification.

CONDITION

A manifestation does not have a value that can reasonably be determined.

OPTION

Record *place of publication not identified*.

Indicate that the information is taken from a source that is outside the manifestation that is being described. For general guidance, see Guidance: Data provenance. [Recording a source of metadata](#). For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. [Recording an unstructured description](#).

**Recommendation 2:** Same comments as for Recommendation 1.

**Recommendation 3:** Same comments as for Recommendation 1.

**Recommendation 4:** Same comments as for Recommendation 1.

**Recommendation 5:** Same comments as for Recommendation 1.

**Recommendation 6:** I support the recommendation.